NEBRASKA REAL PROPERTY APPRAISER BOARD CONFERENCE ROOM "C", LOWER LEVEL NEBRASKA STATE OFFICE BUILDING 301 CENTENNIAL MALL SOUTH, LINCOLN, NE

November 20, 2014 Meeting Minutes

A. OPENING

Chairman Philip Barkley called to order the November 20, 2014 meeting of the Nebraska Real Property Appraiser Board at 9:00 a.m., in conference room "C" located on the lower level of the Nebraska State Office Building, 301 Centennial Mall South, Lincoln, Nebraska.

B. NOTICE OF MEETING

Chairman Barkley announced the notice of the meeting was duly given, posted, published and tendered in compliance with the Open Meetings Act, and all board members received notice simultaneously by email. Publication of official notice of the meeting appeared in the November 17, 2014 edition of the *Lincoln Journal Star*, a legal newspaper of general circulation in this state, as required by the Open Meetings Act. The agenda was kept current in the Nebraska Real Property Appraiser Board office and on the Board's website. Materials generally used by the Board for this meeting were available in the public folder for inspection by the public, and in accordance with the Open Meetings Act. A copy of the Open Meetings Act was available for the duration of the meeting. For the record, Board Members Philip Barkley, Tom Kubert, Larry Saxton, and Marc Woodle were present. Also present were Director, Tyler Kohtz, Business and Licensing Specialist, Natasha Olsen, and Compliance and Education Specialist, Anthony Dreesen. Board Member, Christopher Langemeier, was absent and excused.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Chairman Barkley reminded those present for the meeting that the agenda cannot be altered 24 hours prior to the meeting except for emergency items according to the Open Meetings Act. Board Member Kubert moved to adopt the agenda as printed. Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. With no further discussion, the motion carried with Woodle, Kubert, Saxton and Barkley voting aye.

The Nebraska Real Property Appraiser Board will meet in executive session for review of applicants and enforcement matters.

Board Member Kubert moved that the Board go into executive session for the purpose of reviewing applicants for credentialing, applicants for appraisal management company registration, investigations, and other sensitive matters. A closed session is clearly necessary to prevent needless injury to the reputation of those involved. The time on the meeting clock was 9:02 a.m. Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. The motion carried with Woodle, Saxton, Kubert and Barkley voting aye.

Break from 10:17 a.m. to 10:30 a.m.

Break from 11:20 a.m. to 11:26 a.m.

Board Member Kubert moved to come out of executive session at 12:01 p.m. Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. The motion carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

G. WELCOME AND CHAIR'S REMARKS

Chairman Barkley welcomed the general public, board members and staff. Public members in attendance were Diane Moore and John Ferris.

JOHN CHILDEARS APPEARANCE – 12:02 p.m.

John Childears appeared before the Board. Mr. Childears began by thanking the Board for the opportunity to meet, and provided some introductory background. Mr. Childears indicated that he sat on the first Board from 1990 through 1994; and therefore, has a unique prospective of issues faced by the Board. Mr. Childears continued by saying that a number of people have expressed concern about the Board's process for credentialing and enforcements. He informed the Board that he has a great respect for USPAP, and that the review reports completed for the Board are not USPAP compliant; the original reports submitted to the Board are. Mr. Childears asked the Board to find review appraisers that understand USPAP and are geographic and industry competent.

Mr. Childears indicated that the Board's reviews are not USPAP compliant, and someone on the Board has to recognize this. Chairman Barkley responded, "USPAP is not black and white, and that the reviews utilized by the Board are advisory. The Board uses the reviews as part of the process to establish experience, and to begin a dialog to help applicants through the process. The Board has faith in its chosen reviewers." Mr. Childears followed by saying, "The board members are incorrect because the reviews are incorrect. The Board's reviews were reviewed by nationally recognized USPAP instructors, and they found the reviews to be deficient." Chairman Barkley asked Mr. Childears, "Do you agree that the reviewers also found deficiencies in the original reports?" Mr. Childears answered, "Yes, but your reviewers' foundation is wrong. I ask that you find appraisers are competent." Chairman Barkley responded, "I feel that we are dealing with the situation properly; USPAP is not black and white." Mr. Childears asked, "Do you have qualified reviewers west of York?" Board Member Kubert responded, "The Board selects reviewers with confidence that it can walk up to an administrative judge with the review for a hearing."

Mr. Childears shifted topics slightly, and indicated that the Board's reviewers are not agriculturally competent. For example, 90% of buyers are owner operators, so you will not be able to find information. Mr. Childears asked, "Would the Board credential an applicant that says he or she cannot use the income approach in a report?" Board Member Kubert offered, "If a person does not know the information, he or she should state that the information is not unknown." Board Member Kubert continued, "The Board uses the review as part of the process to qualify the experience." Mr. Childears responded, "You are not listening to my request, your shield is up, and you are not willing to listen." Board Member Saxton spoke for the first time by saying, "I understand what you are saying. We also want quality competent reviewers." Mr. Childears indicated, "This problem has brought powerful lenders into this discussion." According to Mr. Childears, it shouldn't be this way.

Mr. Childears closed by saying that he didn't serve a second term because the Board would not revoke a credential when needed, and would issue credentials to those that didn't deserve it. Mr. Childears indicated that he is not soft on appraisers, but hard on USPAP. Board Member Woodle responded, "I am concerned that appraisers may not be prepared to enter the world, which is why the Board's process is so important."

H. BOARD MEETING MINUTES

1. APPROVAL OF OCTOBER 15, 2014 MEETING MINUTES

Chairman Barkley asked for any additions or corrections to the October 15, 2014 minutes. Member Kubert brought attention to a note on Page 7. Director Kohtz indicated that the applicant "T2013003" should be "T2013005." Chairman Barkley asked Director Kohtz to confirm this. After searching the database, Director Kohtz concluded that the change is correct. Board Member Kubert moved to adopt the October 15, 2014 meeting minutes as amended. Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. The motion carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

I. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Kohtz presented twelve charts outlining the number of appraisers and AMCs as of November 20, 2014. The Director summarized each chart and reported the number of appraisers as follows: 79 total Licensed, 74 resident and 5 reciprocal; 226 total Certified Residential, 180 resident and 46 reciprocal; 403 total Certified General, 258 resident and 145 reciprocal; and 5 Registered for a total of 713 appraisers. The total number of appraisers is up 4 from October 2014, and up 21 from November 2013. Errors in the charts were noted by the Director. The Director also informed the Board that there are 54 Trainees, which is up 1 from October, and up 44 from November 2013.

In addition, the Director addressed the number of temporary permits issued. There were 12 permits issued in October compared to 17 permits issued in September. As of October 31, 2014, 109 temporary permits have been issued for the calendar year. October was the fourth straight month with ten or more temporary permits issued. Finally, Director Kohtz reported 111 AMCs registered, and one new AMC application has been submitted since the last meeting.

J. FINANCIAL REPORT AND CONSIDERATIONS-NOVEMBER 2014

1. APPROVAL OF OCTOBER RECEIPTS AND EXPENDITURES

The receipts and expenditures for October were reviewed by the Director by line item with the Board. Director Kohtz provided details related to some specific October expenses, and made special note of the Legal Services and Other Contractual Services expenditures. For the Real Property Appraiser Program, which includes both the appraiser fund and the AMC fund, a total of \$39,528.92 in expenditures and \$97,737.98 in revenues were reported. As of the end of October, expenses amount to 35.42 percent of the budgeted expenditures for the fiscal year; 33.70 percent of the fiscal year has passed. Finally, Director Kohtz presented three charts outlining the Agency twelve month expenses and revenues, historic cash balance, and twelve month cash balance.

Board Member Kubert moved to accept and file the October 2014 budget reports for audit. Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. The motion carried with Woodle, Kubert, Saxton and Barkley voting aye.

2. NRPAB DATABASE UPDATE ESTIMATES

Director Kohtz informed the Board that CIO did not have the estimates prepared as expected; no discussion.

K. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS

Chairman Barkley asked for any public comments. Diane Moore asked about certifications on preprinted forms. Specifically, Ms. Moore asked, "Does the appraiser need to disclose in the certification that the property has been appraiser by him or her within the previous three years?" Chairman Barkley responded, "An additional certification should be added to the form." Board Member Saxton stated, "I don't think it needs to be in the certification, just as long as it is disclosed." Ms. Moore indicated that she would like clarification for class. Director Kohtz wrapped up the conversation by asking, "Should this topic be added to next month's agenda for discussion?" Chairman Barkley responded, "Yes, please do."

L. EDUCATION

Board Member Kubert moved to take the following actions on education and instructor requests as listed:

Continuing Education Renewal Activities and Instructors

- 1. McKissock, LP
 - a. The Cost Approach (C2716-I) /7 Hours Approve
 - 1. Alan Simmons Approve
- 2. Career Webschool
 - a. A URAR Form Review (C2957-I)/7 Hours Approve
 - 1. A.M. "Bud" Black Approve
- 3. Appraisal Institute
 - a. General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use (C2887)/28 Hours Deny
 - 1. Joseph Magdziarz Deny
 - b. General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach (C009)/27 Hours Deny
 - 1. Mark Ratterman Deny

Seconded by Saxton. Chairman Barkley called for the vote. The motion carried with Woodle, Saxton, Kubert and Barkley voting aye.

M. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- 1. OPEN 3RD CONGRESSIONAL DISTRICT CERTIFIED REAL PROPERTY APPRAISER REPRESENTATIVE POSITION: Director Kohtz informed the Board that the feedback provided by the Board last month was passed along to the Governor's office. Director Kohtz asked if the Board had any additional feedback this month. Board Member Kubert indicated that balance in practice should be emphasized. Director Kohtz responded that he will inform the Governor's office.
- **2. COUNTY APPRAISER CONTRACT UPDATE:** Board Member Kubert asked that this item be removed from the agenda.
- **3. NRPAB STANDARD 3 REVIEW FORM UPDATE:** Compliance and Education Specialist Dreesen informed the Board that he, Director Kohtz, and Business and Licensing Specialist Olsen have met with Ms. Lacey to discuss the Standard 3 Review Form. Two different templates have been prepared for the Board to review based on those discussions. Mr. Dreesen was asked to proceed with the first template.
- 4. REAL ESTATE COMMISSION CONTINUING EDUCATION SUBMISSION CHANGES:
 - Director Kohtz met with Greg Lemon, Alane Roubal, and Tauny Snider to discuss the agency's continuing education submission changes. The Real Estate Commission no longer requires that its licensees submit continuing education certificates for those courses completed in Nebraska. During the visit Director Kohtz was shown the system used by education providers to submit rosters for courses. Within the system, education providers log in, select the appropriate course, then enter the licensee's number. If there is a user error, the system will notify the education provider and the Real Estate Commission. The Director indicated that the Board currently has a request for an estimate to develop a certificate download site through Appraiser Login, but may also consider a system similar to the Real Estate Commission's in the future. Director Kohtz stated that he would like to consider the project if funding is available during this fiscal year, or put it on the strategic planning agenda for future consideration.

5. BOARD MEMBER PORTAL: Director Kohtz offered the Board a demonstration of the Board Member Portal. The Director asked for any comments or questions that board members may have. The Board asked that the applicant files are organized within more folders. For example, the Board would like to see an applicant folder for appraisal reports, Standard 3 reviews, and communications. The Board also asked to see a separate folder that includes consent agreements. Director Kohtz informed the Board that the changes will be made for next month.

N. NEW BUSINESS

1. AMP NATIONAL APPRAISER TEST RESULTS NOTIFICATION CHANGES: Director Kohtz presented the draft forms provided by AMP intended to notify applicants of test results. Director Kohtz asked if the Board has any comments or concerns regarding the forms. With no further discussion, Board Member Kubert made a motion to approve the Test Results Notification Forms as presented. The motion was seconded by Woodle, and carried with Saxton, Woodle, Kubert and Barkley.

Director Kohtz asked the Board if it had a preference regarding applicant approvals for testing. AMP could require that all applicants get approval from board staff prior to being scheduled for examination, or AMP could continue scheduling those that have already been approved to sit for examination. The Board requested that testing approvals be reset on January 1, 2015, and that AMP gets approval for each applicant after this date. Director Kohtz informed the Board that he will notify AMP.

- 2. INVESTIGATION PROCEDURES: Director Kohtz indicated that some informal discussions have been held regarding board member involvement in the Board's investigation process, and asked if the Board had interest in formal discussions regarding this topic. The Board agreed that the item should be placed on the strategic planning agenda for next year.
- **3. WEBSITE APPRAISER CODE ISSUES:** During the October Meeting, Board Member Kubert brought notice to some appraiser code errors in the appraiser listing on the website. Director Kohtz informed the Board that all the errors have been corrected. The Director also asked that he be notified of any future errors noticed.

O. LEGISLATIVE REPORT AND BUSINESS

- 1. LR499: Director Kohtz presented the drafted changes to the Real Property Appraiser Act to the Board for review in REQ00013. The Director went through the bill draft from top to bottom and noted specific changes to the Board's recommendations last month and the reasons for those changes. There was no further discussion.
 - a. Bill Sponsorship: Director Kohtz informed the Board that the members have not yet been selected for the Banking, Commerce and Insurance Committee, but it is important for the Board to have a committee member sponsor the bill if possible. Director Kohtz presented three options for the Board to consider for bill sponsorship, which include waiting until committee members have been selected to approach a Senator about sponsorship, approach a Senator without consideration for committee membership, or approach a Senator about co-sponsorship with the intent of approaching a committee member once the appointments have been made. The Board agreed that Director Kohtz should discuss this with Board Member Langemeier. Director Kohtz informed the Board that he will discuss this matter with Board Member Langemeier and provide a report back at the December meeting.

- **b. Automated Valuation Model:** Director Kohtz presented a report titled "Automated Valuation Model Regulation" to the Board for review. Director Kohtz informed the Board that Board Member Kubert asked that the Board have a discussion regarding its position concerning automated valuation models. Board Member Kubert thanked Director Kohtz for the report, and indicated that it is very informative. Director Kohtz made note of the progression in the Board's thinking over the past two years, and asked the Board if it had any comments. Director Kohtz then asked if it had a preference between the definition showing under "Title 298 Draft" and "REQ00013." The Board agreed that it prefers the definition under "Title 298 Draft." Director Kohtz informed the Board that he will have REQ00013 updated to include this version of the definition, so that the definitions are uniform.
- 2. TITLE 298: Director Kohtz presented the drafted Title 298 changes to the board for consideration. Chairman Barkley indicated that he had some recommendations, and made the following requests: on Page 2 he asked that "and any information referenced by this title" be added after "photos" in section 001.19; in section 001.01C on Page 5, he asked that a seven-hour supervisory appraiser and trainee course of at least seven hours be accepted if completed in another jurisdiction; On Page 16, Chairman Barkley asked that "If the Board finds that the submitted report is not within substantial compliance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice," and "deficiencies found in" be removed from section 002.16; on Page 22, the Chairman asked that sections 004.02I.1 through 004.02I.3 be removed; and on Page 30, he asked that "or exceeds" be added after "meets" in section 001.09. There was no opposition to the Chairman's requests.

Break from 2:50 p.m. to 3:00 p.m.

Director Kohtz brought attention to specific areas in the draft that he would like Board feedback on. The following requests were made during this time: on Page 38 and Page 44, the Board requested that a five year inactivity limit be placed on continuing education and the supervisory appraiser trainee course; on Page 39, that "This course shall not be an appraisal form or writing style based course" be removed from section 003.01L. Finally, Board Member Kubert brought attention to "Section 002.04 of this Chapter" in section 002.07 on Page 15, and indicated that the reference does not make sense. Director Kohtz informed the Board that this is an error, and the reference should be to section 002.06. Because of the amount of information covered, the Board agreed that review should end and resume at the December meeting.

P. BOARD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

- 1. BOARD POLICIES
 - a. Current Board Policies: No discussion.
 - **b. New Board Policies:** Director Kohtz presented new Board Policy 14-06 concerning log requirements for separate trainee real property appraiser/supervisory appraiser relationships to the Board for review. With no further discussion, Board Member Kubert made a motion to approve Board Policy 14-06 as presented. The motion was seconded by Saxton, and carried with Kubert, Woodle, Saxton and Barkley voting aye.

2. APPRAISER FORMS AND PROCEDURES

a. Applicant Experience Log: Director Kohtz presented an updated applicant experience log to the Board for review. The Director explained that changes needed to be made to incorporate new Board Policy 14-06, so it was a good time to redevelop the entire log. The Board requested that the bullet points under "Acceptable Experience Requirements" be changed to numbers, and that "shown above" found in the last sentence of the last bullet point under "Acceptable Experience Requirements" be removed. This sentence should be made to reference the appropriate newly assigned number. The Board also asked that the "2-4 Family" column on the log be shaded. Director Kohtz informed the Board that these changes will be made. Board Member Kubert made a motion to approve the Applicant Experience Log as amended. The motion was seconded by Woodle, and carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

Q. OTHER BUSINESS

1. BOARD MEETINGS

a. Potential for December Emergency Meeting: Director Kohtz asked if the Board had any interest in scheduling a late December meeting for consideration of applicants. The Board agreed to wait until the regular December meeting to make any decision.

2. CONFERENCES/EDUCATION

- a. Olsen Report on CLEAR Basic National Certified Investigator and Instructor Training:
 Business and Licensing Specialist Olsen attended CLEAR Basic National Certified Investigator Training in Portland, Oregon from October 14th through 16th. Ms. Olsen indicated that she had a different idea of what this training was going to be, and continued by saying that training placed a lot of focus on definitions. She informed the Board that many of the participants were from nursing boards, and although the Director for the Texas Nursing Board had interesting stories, most of the information was not applicable to what the Board does; the Board does not conduct investigations to the capacity discussed at the training.
- b. Kubert, Woodle, and Kohtz Fall AARO Conference Report: Board Members Kubert and Woodle, along with Director Kohtz attended the Fall AARO Conference in Washington, D.C. Board Member Kubert presented an outline of topics covered at the conference, and went through the topics line by line. Topics highlighted by Board Member Kubert included: The Appraisal Foundation is developing a compilation of USPAP court cases, and is considering some additional USPAP related courses; the Appraisal Subcommittee is considering a Federal Registry Fee increase, have indicated that a national appraiser/AMC registry number may be implemented soon, is developing a matrix of punishment, and provided information regarding test ages; the Appraiser Qualifications Board has made it clear that education, experience, and examination must be completed prior to January 1, 2015 to qualify for credentialing under the 2008 Real Property Appraiser Qualifications Criteria; some interesting statistics were covered concerning education course CAP approval, for example 19 states require CAP approval for qualifying education, 1 state requires CAP approval for continuing education, and 41 states require CAP approval for distance education; the FDIC speaker indicated that to date, 7000 suspect appraisal reports have been reported; the VA speaker indicated that it is using Core Logic for appraisal management services and has 6,500 appraisers on the panel, the VA has 1,050 rules for grading appraisal reports, and is utilizing a more automated review, which may result in more complaints; Fannie Mae reported that it is utilizing appraisal quality monitoring; and the FHA is now requiring attic pictures.

(continued on next page)

(continued from previous page)

Director Kohtz added the following to Board Member Kubert's presentation: Level 3 Investigator Training will begin this year, which will cover hearing prep and attendance; The Appraisal Foundation has discussed the possibilities of utilizing webinars for hearings; the National Complaint Hotline has had very little impact on states, to date there have been 8000 website hits and 400 phone calls; the Appraisal Subcommittee is considering expanding the opportunity for real time federal registry updates; the CFPB has set up a phone number specifically for appraiser issues; and emergency policies were discussed during the administrator breakout. All three attendees indicated that attendance was worthwhile.

- 3. MEMOS FROM THE BOARD: Director Kohtz requested approval to send a Memo From the Board to inform the appraiser community of the changes to the implementation of the 2015 Real Property Appraiser Qualifications Criteria. Board Member Kubert made a motion to approve a Memo From the Board informing the appraiser community of the changes to the implementation of the 2015 Real Property Appraiser Qualifications Criteria. The motion was seconded by Woodle, and carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.
- **4. APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE:** Director Kohtz informed the Board that the Appraisal Subcommittee's audit will take place March 17th through 19th.
- 5. APPRAISAL FOUNDATION: No discussion.
- C. CONSIDERATION OF APPLICANTS AS NEBRASKA REAL PROPERTY APPRAISER:

Board Member Kubert moved to take the following actions for applicants as listed:

T14026 / Approve as Trainee Real Property Appraiser.

L14005 / Approve to sit for exam; select and send three reports for review. Board Member Saxton assigned.

CR14022 / Approve to sit for exam; select and send three reports for review. Board Member Woodle assigned.

CR14024 / Hold

CR14021R / Approve as Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser.

CR14023R / Approve as Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser.

CG14041 / Approve to sit for exam; select and send three reports for review. Board Member Kubert assigned.

CG14038R / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CG14042R / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CG14039R / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CG14040R / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CG14001 / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser; send advisory letter.

CR14006 / Approve as Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser; send advisory letter.

CG14011 / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CG14021 / Hold; decline request.

CG14010 / Approve as Certified General Real Property Appraiser.

CR14010 / Request applicant to submit two additional reports, 1 new 2-4 unit residential property report, and 1 new single family residential property report, completed after November 20, 2014.

- CG14015 / Hold
- CR14013 / Approve as Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser.
- CR14018 / Approve as Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser.
- CR14016 / Hold
- CR14017 / Approve to sit for exam; select three reports for review.
- CG14037 / Approve to sit for exam; select and send three reports for review.
- CR14019 / Hold
- CR14020 / Hold
- CG21262T / Approve contingent upon receipt of letter of good standing from the State of Illinois on or before December 1, 2014.
- CG21263T / Approve contingent upon receipt of letter of good standing from the State of Illinois on or before December 1, 2014.
- CG21264T / Approve contingent upon receipt of letter of good standing from the State of Illinois on or before December 1, 2014.

Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. Motion carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

D. REGISTRATION AS APPRAISAL MANAGEMENT COMPANY

Board Member Kubert moved to take the following action for the AMC applicant as listed:

NE2014007 / Approve

Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. Motion carried with Woodle, Kubert, Saxton and Barkley voting aye.

E. CONSIDERATION OF DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS/ENFORCEMENT MATTERS:

Vice Chair Kubert moved to take the following enforcement actions:

- 13-14 / Close
- 13-15 / Close
- 14-31 / Close
- 14-35 / Send copy of redacted Standard 3 review, request a written response to Standard 3 review, and invite to informal meeting. Board Member Woodle appointed as Investigating Board Member.

Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. Motion carried with Woodle, Saxton, Kubert and Barkley voting aye.

Vice Chair Kubert moved to take the following enforcement actions:

- 13-23 / Select appraisal report for review; request true copy of selected appraisal report and workfile.
- 13-24 / Hold
- 13-25 / Hold
- 13-26 / Request fully completed log to be submitted by December 1, 2014. Board Member Barkley authorized to select appraisal report for review; request true copy of selected appraisal report and workfile.
- 14-15 / Hold
- 14-16 / Hold
- 14-17 / Hold
- 14-18 / Hold

14-19 / Hold

14-20 / Hold

14-29 / Dismiss without prejudice; send advisory letter.

14-34 / Send appraisal report and workfile for Standard 3 review.

Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. Motion carried with Saxton, Kubert and Woodle voting aye. Barkley abstained.

Board Member Woodle moved to take the following enforcement actions:

13-18 / Hold

13-19 / Hold

14-22 / Hold

14-23 / Hold

14-24 / Hold

14-26 / Hold

14-27 / Hold

Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. Motion carried with Woodle, Saxton and Barkley voting aye. Kubert abstained.

Vice Chair Kubert moved to take the following enforcement actions:

13-21 / Hold

14-32 / Hold

14-33 / Hold

Board Member Saxton seconded the motion. Motion carried with Kubert, Saxton and Barkley voting aye. Woodle abstained.

F. CONSIDERATION OF OTHER EXECUTIVE SESSION ITEMS:

Inquiry I13-4, I14-9, I14-22, I14-29, I14-30, and I14-31 were discussed.

The Board discussed new staff initiated Inquiry I14-34, in which an organization appears to be operating as an appraisal management company without first obtaining authorization from the Board.

Personnel matters were discussed.

Vice Chair Kubert moved to take the following actions for other executive session items:

I13-4 / Close

I14-9 / Close

I14-22 / Close

I14-29 / Close; send advisory letter.

I14-30 / Close; send advisory letter.

I14-31 / Close; send advisory letter.

I14-32 / Hold

I14-33 / Hold

I14-34 / Close; send advisory letter.

Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. Motion carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

R. ADJOURNMENT

Board Member Kubert moved to adjourn the meeting. Board Member Woodle seconded the motion. Motion carried with Saxton, Kubert, Woodle and Barkley voting aye.

At 4:04 p.m. Chairman Barkley adjourned the November 20, 2014 meeting of the Real Property Appraiser Board.

Respectfully submitted,

Tyler N. Kohtz Director

These minutes were available for public inspection on December 8, 2014, in compliance with Nebraska Revised Statute §84-1413 (5).